
AGENDA ITEM No. 2

MINUTES

<u>Meeting:</u>	Planning Committee
<u>Date:</u>	9 August 2013 at 10.00 am
<u>Venue:</u>	The Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell
<u>Chair:</u>	Clr Mrs L C Roberts
<u>Present:</u>	Mr P Ancell, Miss P Beswick, Clr D Birkinshaw, Clr P Brady, Clr C Carr, Clr D Chapman, Clr A Favell, Clr Mrs H M Gaddum, Clr Mrs N Hawkins, Mr C Pennell, Clr Mrs K Potter, Clr Mrs J A Twigg.
<u>Apologies for Absence:</u>	Clr H Laws, Mr G Nickolds, Clr P Rippon, Clr Ms E Wilcox.

111/13 MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 12 July 2013 were approved as a correct record subject to the following amendment:

MINUTE 97/13 MEMBERS' DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

Item 11 – amend the sentence to read “It was noted that some Members had received emails and letters from Dr Owens.”

112/13 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

7 members of the public had given notice to speak at the meeting.

113/13 MEMBERS' DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

The following Members declared an interest in items on the agenda:

Item 12

- Clr Mrs L Roberts, personal interest as she had received a letter from the Applicant Mr T Turner
- Clr Mrs K Potter, personal interest as a member of Friends of the Peak District
- Mr C Pennell, personal interest as a member of Friends of the Peak District and as a member of the National Trust
- Miss P Beswick, personal interest as a member of the National Trust
- Clr P Brady, personal interest as a member of the National Trust

Item 17

- Miss P Beswick, personal interest as a member of English Heritage
- Mr C Pennell, personal interest as a member of English Heritage

114/13 6. FULL APPLICATION – CONVERSION OF FORMER UNITED REFORM CHURCH TO 2 DWELLINGS AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/0212/0153, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)

As Items 6 to 11 inclusive related to the same development, the Chair exercised her discretion to allow each of the three speakers on these items to make one representation about the scheme as a whole.

The Chair emphasised that Members would be voting on each individual application in accordance with procedure.

The Officer gave an overview of the six applications by means of general introduction.

Following observations made during the site visit of the previous day, the Officer proposed that condition 5 should be amended to include a scheme of obscure glazing to be submitted and approved in relation to the north elevation.

The Officer corrected Key Issue 2 on page 3 of Item 8 to read:

“2. Whether the principle of the conversion of the church building to one open-market dwelling is acceptable.”

The following were present to make representations under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mrs L Cliffe, neighbour, expressing a particular concern
- Mr N Richmond, resident of the area and Objector. Mr Richmond also declared that he was an officer of the planning authority.
- Mr P Koyander, Agent

. A further amendment to condition 5 was proposed to protect the leaded lights by using secondary obscure glazing. Following discussion it was also suggested that conditions be added to ensure recording of the building before conversion and to ensure satisfactory detailing of the wall and coping detail for the revised access.

Members acknowledged the efforts made by all concerned to formulate the proposals.

The motion for approval including the amended and additional conditions was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Agree amended plan no's 653/008 Rev B, 003 Rev D, 011 & 012 showing existing/proposed sections, the amended access/parking layout and omission of the local needs bungalow.**
- 2. Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**

3. Omit four rooflights serving en-suites and dressing room.
4. Internal plan layouts to be provided and retained as shown on the approved plans, including the ground floor timber screens and first floor balcony features. Any future changes to the internal plan layout to be submitted for written approval of the Authority.
5. Existing leaded light window frames to all window openings to be retained and a scheme of obscure, secondary glazing on the north elevation to be submitted and approved.
6. Minor design conditions.
7. Access, car parking/manoeuvring facilities to be completed prior to the occupation of any of the dwellings.
8. Submit and agree amended car parking/manoeuvring layout.
9. Ground levels of the access road and car parking/manoeuvring areas to be no higher than the existing ground levels. Submit and agree plans showing the finished levels and wall details, including copings.
10. Submit and agree landscaping scheme for hard and soft landscaping and boundary walls/fences. Scheme to include details of the finished appearance of the lowered section of walling on the northern side of the access entrance.
11. Submit and agree scheme for external lighting.
12. Withdraw permitted development rights for alterations, extensions, porches, ancillary buildings, solar panels, walls, fences and satellite dishes.
13. Submit and agree drainage details and surfacing materials for the access road, car parking/manoeuvring areas.
14. Allocation of parking spaces to be as shown on the approved plan and two spaces per dwelling to be maintained for each dwelling free from obstruction.
15. Northern boundary wall between the URC church site and Sherwood Copse to be permanently maintained at its present height.
16. Submit and agree scheme of Environmental Management measures.
17. Highway conditions.
18. Ecological enhancement conditions.
19. A photographic record of the site and buildings to be made prior to the commencement of any works.

115/13 7. CONSERVATION AREA CONSENT APPLICATION – CONVERSION OF FORMER UNITED REFORM CHURCH TO 2 DWELLINGS AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/1112/1104, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Standard 3 year consent.**
- 2. Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**
- 3. Submit and agree scheme showing details of the finished appearance of the lowered sections of walling on the northern and southern sides of the access entrance.**
- 4. Ecological enhancement conditions.**

116/13 8. FULL APPLICATION – DEMOLITION OF ATTACHED OUTBUILDINGS AND CHANGE OF USE FROM SUNDAY SCHOOL TO DWELLING AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/0212/0150, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)

The Officer clarified the policy distinctions relating to buildings within and outside of settlements.

It was noted that the Sunday School building was rendered, in common with some other buildings in Tideswell. In response to Members' questions, the Officer confirmed that it could be re-rendered to improve its appearance.

In response to Members' queries about the proposed lowered sections of the wall, Officers suggested amended wording for condition 9 to ensure satisfactory wall and coping detailing.

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Agree amended plan no's 653/008 Rev B, 003 Rev D, 011 & 012 showing existing/proposed sections, the amended access/parking layout and omission of the local needs bungalow.**
- 2. Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**
- 3. Internal plan layouts to be provided and retained as shown on the approved plans. Any future changes to the internal plan layout to be submitted for written approval of the Authority.**
- 4. Obscure-glaze windows to arched openings facing Parke Road (South Elevation) and arched opening to the kitchen facing Sherwood Road (West**

Elevation).

5. **Minor design conditions.**
6. **Access, car parking/manoeuvring facilities to be completed prior to the occupation of any of the dwellings.**
7. **Submit and agree amended car parking/manoeuvring layout.**
8. **Ground levels of the access road and car parking/manoeuvring areas to be no higher than the existing ground levels. Submit and agree plans showing the finished levels.**
9. **Submit and agree landscaping scheme for hard and soft landscaping and boundary walls/fences. Scheme to include details of the finished appearance of the lowered section of walling on the northern side of the access entrance and wall details, including copings.**
10. **Submit and agree scheme for external lighting.**
11. **Withdraw permitted development rights for alterations, extensions, porches, ancillary buildings, solar panels, wall, fences and satellite dishes.**
12. **Submit and agree drainage details and surfacing materials for the access road, car parking/manoeuvring areas.**
13. **Allocation of parking spaces to be as shown on the approved plan and two spaces per dwelling to be maintained for each dwelling free from obstruction.**
14. **Northern boundary wall between the URC church site and Sherwood Copse to be permanently maintained at its present height.**
15. **Submit and agree scheme of Environmental Management measures.**
16. **Highway conditions.**
17. **Ecological enhancement conditions.**

117/13 9. CONSERVATION AREA CONSENT APPLICATION – DEMOLITION OF ATTACHED OUTBUILDINGS, CONVERSION OF SUNDAY SCHOOL TO A DWELLING AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/1112/1103, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. **Standard 3 year consent.**
2. **Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**
3. **Submit and agree scheme showing details of the finished appearance of the lowered sections of walling on the northern and southern sides of the**

access entrance.

4. **Ecological enhancement conditions.**

118/13 **10. FULL APPLICATION – BLOCKING UP OF EXISTING WINDOW, NEW WINDOW IN KITCHEN AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, THE SCHOOL HOUSE, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/0212/0159, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)**

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. **Agree amended plan no's 653/008 Rev B, 003 Rev D, 011 & 012 showing existing/proposed sections, the amended access/parking layout and omission of the local needs bungalow.**
2. **Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**
3. **Minor design conditions.**
4. **Access, car parking/manoeuvring facilities to be completed prior to the occupation of any of the dwellings.**
5. **Submit and agree amended car parking/manoeuvring layout.**
6. **Ground levels of the access road and car parking/manoeuvring areas to be no higher than the existing ground levels. Submit and agree plans showing the finished levels.**
7. **Submit and agree landscaping scheme for hard and soft landscaping and boundary walls/fences. Scheme to include details of the finished appearance of the lowered section of walling on the northern side of the access entrance.**
8. **Submit and agree scheme for external lighting.**
9. **Withdraw permitted development rights for alterations, extensions, porches, ancillary buildings, solar panels, wall, fences and satellite dishes.**
10. **Submit and agree drainage details and surfacing materials for the access road, car parking/manoeuvring areas.**
11. **Allocation of parking spaces to be as shown on the approved plan and two spaces per dwelling to be maintained for each dwelling free from obstruction.**
12. **Northern boundary wall between the URC church site and Sherwood Copse to be permanently maintained at its present height.**
13. **Submit and agree scheme of Environmental Management measures.**
14. **Highway conditions.**

15. Ecological enhancement conditions.

119/13 11. CONSERVATION AREA CONSENT APPLICATION – BLOCKING UP OF EXISTING WINDOW, NEW WINDOW IN KITCHEN AND CREATION OF NEW ACCESS AND PARKING INCLUDING DEMOLITION AND REBUILDING OF ROADSIDE FRONTAGE WALL, PARKE ROAD, TIDESWELL, (NP/DDD/1112/1106, P.9262, 09.10.2012, 415078 375698/KW)

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Standard 3-year consent.**
- 2. Agree amended Design and Access Statement.**
- 3. Submit and agree scheme showing details of the finished appearance of the lowered sections of walling on the northern and southern sides of the access entrance.**
- 4. Ecological enhancement conditions.**

A break was taken between 11.30am and 11.40am.

120/13 12. FULL APPLICATION – REMOVAL OF AGRICULTURAL RESTRICTIONS ATTACHED TO EXISTING FARMHOUSE AND FARM COTTAGE AND ERECTION OF REPLACEMENT AGRICULTURAL WORKER'S DWELLING. ALTERATIONS AND EXTENSION OF MAIN FARMHOUSE AND FARM COTTAGE TO FORM A SINGLE PRIVATE DWELLING, INCLUDING LINK EXTENSION AND CONVERSION OF COURTYARD BARN TO ADDITIONAL LIVING ACCOMMODATION INCLUDING USE OF ONE BEDROOM FOR B&B ACCOMMODATION, DEMOLITION OF DILAPIDATED FARM BUILDINGS, AND ERECTION OF NEW BARN AND FARMYARD, CONVERSION AND CHANGE OF USE OF DETACHED COURTYARD BARN FOR CHEESE PRODUCTION AND ASSOCIATED STORAGE, REPOSITIONING OF EXISTING VEHICLE ACCESS, REINSTATEMENT AND MANAGEMENT OF THE NATURAL LANDSCAPE SURROUNDING THE FARM, COW CLOSE FARM, HATHERSAGE (NP/DDD/0213/0087, P5987, 18.02.2013, 423369 382916/KW)

The Chair declared that she, Cllr A Favell and Cllr Mrs J Twigg had received correspondence from the applicant.

The Officer stated that the key issue was the proposed removal of an agricultural occupancy condition on the existing farmhouse and cottage. Although the potential improvements detailed in the proposals were acknowledged, Officers considered them to be insufficient to justify a departure from policy.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr T Turner, Applicant

During the site visit of the previous day, Members and Officers had noted the presence of a timber structure in the farmyard. The Officer explained that this was temporary accommodation for the applicant's family between moving out of their house in Hathersage and moving into the farmhouse at Cow Close Farm. In these

circumstances, planning regulations may allow for it within the curtilage of the dwelling whilst the house is refurbished, however its scale and apparent permanence required closer examination. Officers confirmed that this would be investigated.

Members would have liked to have seen a full business plan for the proposals. They welcomed the comments made by the Parish Council, as detailed in the report. Clarification was sought on the nature of the existing agricultural ties.

The recommendation of refusal was moved and seconded.

The reasons for refusal were discussed and the Officer confirmed that the wording was appropriate in its application to the wider agricultural holding.

The recommendation as moved and seconded was voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. The erection of replacement dwelling would be contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP2, HC2 and Local Plan policies LC12, LH3. No functional agricultural need to justify the erection of the proposed new-build agricultural worker's dwelling.**
- 2. In the absence of a detailed justification, the removal of the agricultural occupancy condition on the main farmhouse would be contrary to policy LH3.**
- 3. The proposed agricultural dwelling and its associated domestic curtilage is situated in a prominent position on the southern edge of the existing farm complex. The proposed dwelling site is visible from the nearby public footpaths which pass to the east and west of the farm complex. The erection of a new dwelling in open countryside, without special justification, would detract from the landscape character of the locality and the National Park, contrary to Core Strategy and Local Plan policies GSP1, GSP3, L1.**

121/13 13. FULL APPLICATION – ERECTION OF DWELLING ON LAND AT THE PINFOLD, MONYASH ROAD, BAKEWELL (NP/DDD/0413/0279, P11904, 29/07/2013, 421217/368192/ALN)

The Officer confirmed that following an appeal, approval was in place for a new house on the site. However, the current proposals were for a bigger, typical 3-bedroomed house rather than the converted farm building approved on appeal and they would have a significant impact upon the setting and on neighbours of the site.

The Authority's Historic Buildings Architect had accepted the roof space development as approved in January 2009 but the current proposals were not the same.

It was noted that maintenance of the site had improved since the appeal decision.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr P Gray, Agent

Members moved and seconded deferral to allow more information to be submitted about the recent auction and issues of saleability of the proposed house. However, this

motion fell in the vote.

The recommendation for refusal was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. As a result of its massing and design, the proposed dwelling (as amended) would fail to reflect or respect the locally distinctive historic pattern of development at the Pinfold and would therefore detract from the special qualities of the surrounding Conservation Area, and fail to preserve the valued characteristics of an important open space within the Conservation Area contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP3 and L3 and Local Plan policies LB2, LC4 and LC5. Consequently, the new dwelling would not achieve the conservation or enhancement of a valued vernacular building, or its setting, contrary to the requirements of Core Strategy policy HC1(C).**
- 2. In this case, the benefits of granting planning permission for the proposed house do not otherwise offset or outweigh objections to the amended scheme on design and conservation grounds because the site is no longer despoiled to any significant extent, the enhancements to the site could be achieved by a less damaging practicable option, and as amended, the submitted application would not provide sufficient overriding justification for a new house to meet general demand in accordance with the requirements of policies HC1(C)II and GSP2 of the Core Strategy.**

In accordance with Standing Orders, Members considered whether to extend the meeting beyond 1pm. The motion to continue was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the meeting continue beyond 1pm.

- 122/13 14. SECTION 73 APPLICATION – REMOVAL OF CONDITION 3 HOLIDAY OCCUPANCY RESTRICTION FROM APPLICATION NP/DDD/0512/0503, VICTORIA MILL STABLES, BUXTON ROAD, BAKEWELL (NP/DDD/0513/0418, P.7435, 421645 / 368802, 26/7/2013/AM)**

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr D Oulsnam, Agent

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reason:

- 1. The proposal fails to meet the requirements of Core Strategy Policy HC1(C) because the removal of planning condition is not required in order to achieve conservation of the curtilage listed building and the proposal would not otherwise enhance the significance of the heritage asset, or the special historic or architectural interest of the curtilage listed building and its setting.**

It was noted that Item 15 had been withdrawn from the agenda.

Members broke for lunch between 1.15pm and 1.45pm.

Chair: Clr Mrs L Roberts

Present: Mr P Ancell, Miss P Beswick, Clr D Birkinshaw, Clr P Brady,
Clr C Carr, Clr D Chapman, Clr A R Favell Clr Mrs H M Gaddum,
Clr Mrs N Hawkins, Mr C Pennell, Clr Mrs K Potter, Clr Mrs J A Twigg.

Apologies: Clr H Laws, Mr G D Nickolds, Clr P Rippon, Clr Ms E Wilcox

123/13 16. FULL PLANNING APPLICATION – ERECTION OF A SINGLE AFFORDABLE DWELLING – LAND ADJACENT TO THORNEYCROFT, SUMMER CROSS, TIDESWELL (NP/DDD/0613/0507, P.7053, 14/6/2013, 414866 / 375646, MN)

The Officer made the correction that this was an Outline application, not Full, and therefore Members were asked only to consider the principle of the proposals with all other matters reserved.

He stated that as the Applicant already had a house in the village, there was no qualifying local need for the proposed new dwelling.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr T Gratton, Applicant

Although Members appreciated the difficulties of the Applicant's current circumstances, the landscape impact of the proposals would not be acceptable under planning policy. Members wanted this fact to be added as a third reason for refusal. It was suggested that the Applicant should contact the Derbyshire Dales District Council's Rural Housing Enabler for advice.

The recommendation for refusal, including the third reason, was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. **The application does not comply with Development Plan Policy LH1 and the Supplementary Planning Guidance document *Meeting the local need for affordable housing in the Peak District National Park* due to the applicant's current home ownership;**
2. **The applicant does not comply with the occupancy criteria for an affordable dwelling set out in Development Plan Policy LH2.**
3. **Landscape impact contrary to planning policy regulation of the extension of a village into the countryside.**

124/13 17. LISTED BUILDING APPLICATION – REPLACEMENT OF THE REAR ELEVATION GROUND FLOOR AND FIRST FLOOR WINDOWS AND THE REPLACEMENT OF THE FRONT ELEVATION GROUND FLOOR WINDOWS AT ST JOHN'S CHURCH, LONGNOR (NP/SM/0513/0410, P5510, 17/05/2013, 408356/361894/ALN)

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. 3 year time limit for implementation**
- 2. Adopt submitted plans**
- 3. Frames to be painted an off white colour with a matt finish**
- 4. Frames to be inset from front face of wall to same depth as existing frames**

125/13 18. PLANNING APPEALS (A.1536/AMC)

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

The meeting ended at 2.15pm.